

**Correction to Figs. 1 & 2 in PC-33 (comments of GSACC and others including Greenpeace)**

This is a correction submitted by Larry Edwards of Greenpeace on January 12, 2013, to comments (PC-33) submitted by his organization and four others. PC-33 is the comments of five organizations on the Feasibility Assessment for deer intensive management in Unit-1A.

On pages 25 and 26 of PC-33 there is an error in the quantities shown for Gravina Island in Figures 1 and 2. The correct values are shown below and on the next page.

The carrying capacity of WAA 101 (the entirety of Gravina Island) shown in Figure 2 should have been 9.4 instead of 7.3 deer per square mile. The corresponding overestimation by the 1997 versus the 2008 deer model should then have been 38% instead of the 77% that was shown in both Figs. 1 and 2. All other values in the Figures are correct.

The reason for this revision of the figures is that the deer multiplier recommended by ADF&G in 2002 (see Attachment-1 of our comments, PC-33 at 14 to 26) can be applied to the deer model results in either of two way, in which case either of two values need to be used for the multiplier to get the correct result. The 2002 ADF&G document recommends using one of those values at 26 in PC-33, and because of changes to how the 2008 deer reports its final results, this is not the value we should have used in our Figures. The matter of which value to use is explained in Appendix to the 2002 ADF&G document at 25 to 26 in PC-33. We should have used a value of 45 instead of 35 deer per square mile.

The corrected figures are below and on the next page. The overestimation of 38% (instead of 77%) for Gravina Island is still quite large and none of the conclusions we have reached in our comments are changed.

Corrected Fig. 1:

Unit 1-A	<b>39%</b>	<b>Overestimation</b>
Gravina Island	<b>38%</b>	<b>Overestimation</b>
Revillagigedo Island	<b>60%</b>	<b>Overestimation</b>
Cleveland Peninsula	<b>34%</b>	<b>Overestimation</b>

See also the corrected Fig. 2 on the next page.

Submitted by:



Larry Edwards

Fig. 2: Unit-1A Deer Model Carrying Capacities by WAA, for 1997 vs. 2008 models Edwards (23Dec12, for BoG comments)

WAA Location	WAA Number	1997 Model	2008 Model	Model Comparison	If Deer Mult. = 45	1997 Model	2008 Model	1997 Model	2008 Model
		Carrying Capacity	Carrying Capacity	1995 Over-estimation	2006 Carrying Capacity	Land Area (sq-mi)	Area Weighted Capacity	Land Area (sq-mi)	Area Weighted Capacity
Gravina	101	13	21	-38%	9.4	62.1	807	585	9.4
Duke I.	303	19	18	3%	-	73.3	1393	1348	18.4
Revilla, east shore	404	22	12	86%	-	281.4	6191	3321	
Revilla, Thorne Arm to Behm	405	24	18	34%	-	83.4	2002	1495	
Revilla, Carroll Inlet	406	20	12	64%	-	194.6	3892	2374	
Revilla, George Inlet	407	13	15	-12%	-	64.2	835	953	11.7
Revilla, Ketchikan	408	7	13	-46%	-	26.0	182	335	
Revilla, Clover to Francis	509	17	14	25%	-	105.6	1795	1431	
Revilla, Traitors to Bell I.	510	17	10	79%	-	237.1	4031	2252	
Revilla, Burroughs Bay	511	15	5	195%	-	83.3	1250	424	
Cleveland, Spacious Bay	612	20	18	13%	-	107.9	2158	1907	
Cleveland, Helm Bay	613	24	19	29%	-	71.0	1704	1321	
Cleveland, Meyers Chuck	614	15	20	-24%	-	20.5	308	407	18.3
Cleveland, base	715	15	8	92%	-	158.7	2381	1238	
Unuk River	716	3	4	-21%	-	523.8	1571	1980	3.0
Chickamin & Walker Cove	717	8	4	79%	-	227.0	1816	1012	8.0
Rudyerd Bay	719	4	4	-8%	-	311.9	1248	1354	4.0
Smeaton Bay	821	15	9	67%	-	173.4	2601	1554	15.0
Boca de Quadra	822	10	8	18%	-	608.9	6089	5170	10.0
<b>Unit 1-A total</b>						3,414	42,251	30,460	12.4
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6
									18.8
									11.7
									18.3
									3.8
									8.0
									4.5
									4.3
									9.0
									8.5
									13.6